

## **WEST UNIVERSITY HISTORIC ZONE ADVISORY BOARD**

### **Minutes of Meeting**

**May 6, 2008**

1. The West University Historic Zone Advisory Board met at the Presbyterian Church at 400 East University Avenue in Room 22 on Tuesday, May 6, 2008. The meeting was called to order by Jim Bly, Chair, at 6:10 p.m.

**Members Present:** Jim Bly, Chair; Lori Boston, Barbara Macri, Jim Phillips, Noah Sensibar, Co-chair and Matt Williams (arrived 6:20 p.m.).

**Members Absent:** Colleen Graham, David Knudson, and Jim Witmer.

**Guests:** Diane and Jesus Castro, Roy and June Chamberlin, Brad Chilcote, Bob Demers and Therese Perreault, John McDonnell, Ed Stokes.

2. **Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes:** Minutes of April 1, 2008 (revised) approved as submitted.
3. **127 E. 1<sup>st</sup> Street – HPZ – 08-17 (Zoning Violation) – John McDonnell – Proposed remodel/enlarge garage.** Mr. McDonnell stated he was not aware of the historic requirements and expanded his existing garage from 430 square feet to 777 square feet. He noted that he installed four new aluminum windows, three new entry doors, and two stamped vinyl automatic garage doors. In addition, a new electrical connection and new corrugated sheet metal was put on the roof and outside walls of the garage. Board members were shown photographs of the existing garage before enlargement and after enlargement. It was noted that the old garage doors rolled on a track. Board members explained to Mr. McDonnell that the West University Design Guidelines require the use of wood windows and doors, and that stamped vinyl is not an acceptable construction material for the area. Board members noted that roof details had been changed and rafter tails with an overhang was lost on the south side; in particular the north and south sides of the roof did not match.

**Motion:** Noah Sensibar made a motion to recommend approval of the garage expansion but to recommend denial of the garage plans as submitted and to require the replacement of the windows and doors with a wood product, to require the replacement of the garage doors with a metal door and to replace the rafter tails and roof overhang on the south side. Motion seconded by Jim Phillips. Motion passes with five ayes and one abstention (Matt Williams abstained since he came late and missed most of the discussion).

4. **715 E. University Avenue – HPZ – 08-18 – Henry Werchan – Proposed new construction of second dwelling unit with garage.** Mr. Werchan introduced himself and his wife and noted that some items on the plans were incorrect such as

the materials list on page 1 due to the fact that the plans were purchased “kit” plans and were used as a starting point for the building. He stated the project is to construct a 720 square feet, two story building in the rear of his property. A two-car garage would be located on ground level with a two-bedroom apartment located on the second level. The proposed garage/apartment would be accessed off the alley in the rear of the property. The total building height would be twenty-two feet, eight inches high with no mechanical located on the roof. Mr. Werchan described the proposed materials and design details for his project. These would included exposed rafter tails 24” on-center for the roof, a hip roof design to match the main residence, double-hung wood windows, wood doors and wood entry stairs painted to match the trim, stucco to match the main residence, and concrete sills for the windows. Mr. Werchan stated the only detail he is not sure of is what garage door to use – he is looking at a baked-enamel-over-steel with acrylic window detail, similar to a carriage house design. He stated that he is considering acrylic because the alley the garage would face is experiencing vandalism.

The Board discussed the project and was supportive of the design. Some Board members objected to the use of baked-enamel-over-steel and suggested the use of wood or rusted metal for the garage doors.

**Motion:** Matt Williams made a motion to recommend approval of the plans as submitted with the condition that the garage doors are made of wood. If wood garage doors are not preferred, and then rusted metal can be used with the design to be approved through a Minor Review. Lori Boston seconded the motion. The motion passes unanimously.

5. **933 N. 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue – HPZ – 08 – 21 (Zoning Violation) - Edward Stokes – Proposed new metal roof on primary and secondary structures.** Mr. Stokes introduced himself as managing the estate of his deceased father who owns the property. He stated that the property includes two structures that were re-roofed with metal. The main residence fronts 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and the second residence is a large multi-family structure in the rear of the property. Th old roofs were layered wood shake with cement composite and were leaking. He stated his research found the only true historic replacement roofing was wood shakes but that was not a currently acceptable roofing material. He felt metal would be more historic than asphalt shingles. He added new wood decking and two-inch foam insulation to the roof and then covered these with Delta rib metal roof that was not extremely shiny. He stated that the only insulation for the building was the foam under the metal – it is not possible to put foam under asphalt shingles.

The Board stated that metal roofs were currently not allowed on primary structures and noted that there were no metal roofs located in the Development Zone of this property. Mr. Stokes asked the Board for acceptable roofing materials. The Board stated he should look at what is used in his Development Zone.

**Motion:** Noah Sensibar made the motion to recommend approval of the use of metal roofing for the rear structure but to recommend denial for the use of metal roofing on the main residence. Jim Phillips seconded the motion. The motion passes with five ayes and one nay (Matt Williams).

6. **907 N. 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue – HPZ – 08 – 22 (Zoning Violation) – Roy Chamberlin - Proposed replacement of windows.** Mr. Chamberlin stated termites damaged the old windows and he replaced 17 windows with single-hung fiberglass windows (low E double-pane glass) of original size. Mr. Chamberlin noted that he did not know that he was required to follow special historic guidelines and that the neighborhood needs to do a better job of making the requirements known to realtors. The Board stated the West University Review Board has never approved fiberglass replacement windows due to neighborhood design guidelines and the City of Tucson Development Standard No. 9-02.3.9 states that “window location, size, shape, function, and materials are maintained”.

**Motion:** Lori Boston made the motion to recommend denial of the plans as submitted and recommend the fiberglass windows be replaced with wood windows that match the style of the old windows. Noah Sensibar seconded the motion. The motion passes unanimously.

7. **901 N. 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue – HPZ – 08-24 (Zoning Violation) – Robert Demers & Therese Perreault – Proposed replacement of windows.** Mr. Demers and Ms. Perreault stated they had replaced their windows (aprox. 13) with aluminum-clad wood windows with divided lights of the same size. Noah Sensibar read the minutes of 11-6-07 where Ms. Perreault had come to the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board to find out if aluminum or fiberglass windows were acceptable and the Board had clearly stated only wood windows were acceptable. There was confusion over whether Ms. Perreault had gone through a Minor Review in the Fall of 2007 or not. Noah read the West University Design Guidelines for windows on page 23 that states “Maintain the original size and shape and the original number of panes...” and City of Tucson Development Standards No. 9-02.3.9 states that “window location, size, shape, function, and materials are maintained”. Mr. Demers stated that he researched his house style as Prairie bungalow due to a hipped roof and grilled windows so he shopped for a window suitable for this house. Mr. Demers and Ms. Perreault stated they were concerned with energy efficiency and ease of maintenance.

**Motion:** Matt Williams made a motion to recommend denial of the aluminum-clad wood windows and to recommend replacement with wood double-hung windows and to try to duplicate the diamond light pattern of the original windows and if that is economically prohibitive, then to pattern the window style with other examples within the Development Zone. Jim Phillips seconded the motion. The motion passes with five ayes and one abstention (Barbara Macri).

8. **202 E. Speedway Blvd – Wings on Words School –HPZ – 08-23 – Barbara Kiernan (applicant) – Jesus Castro (architect) - Proposed remodel and new construction.** This project has previously gone through two Preliminary Reviews with extensive discussion. The architect, Mr. Castro presented plans that included the Board's recommended change to use metal casement windows instead of glass block for the classroom windows. Last month during Preliminary Review, the design was changed to include a rock foundation and buttress on a stuccoed building. Board members recommended a two-foot roof overhang due to the size of the building and suggested exposed rafter tails and Mr. Castro added those to the plans. Mr. Castro showed an example of the faux rock that would be used. Mr. Castro also had an Alternative Façade Option that shows a lower height for the rock "foundation" and eliminates the buttress design in exchange for a "faux" capped supporting column.

**Motion:** Jim Bly made a motion to recommend approval of the Alternate Façade Option as submitted. Matt Williams seconded the motion. Motion passes unanimously.

9. **528 N. 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue – Preliminary Review – Brad Chilcote (owner) – Proposed renovation of duplex into single family residence; lot split and new construction of single-family residence.** This is the second Preliminary Review for this project. Barbara Macri read the minutes of the previous meeting (April 1, 2008) to review the Board's issues. The previous concerns centered on the placement of building entrances and the number and placement of parking spaces. Mr. Chilcote showed new designs for the two proposed four-bedroom residences. The Board requested Mr. Chilcote maintain the window sills on the existing structure when it is stuccoed. Mr. Chilcote's new design for the existing residence showed the parking spaces moved to the side where an existing curb cut is located. The fencing material will be corrugated metal similar to the adjacent residence with a wall height of five feet four inches (5'4").

In addition, Mr. Chilcote's plans showed construction of a new 1,400 square foot, four-bedroom residence on the rear of the property facing Jacobus Avenue. He had photographs of new bungalows that had been built along Jacobus. Mr. Chilcote had redesigned the second unit with a front entrance, and a step up onto a front porch to mirror traditional bungalow style. The two parking spaces are now located on the side of the building. Mr. Chilcote noted he would use wood windows and wood doors for the second residence.

Board members expressed concern that the south elevation of the proposed new structure was mostly a blank wall. They recommended a second window to match the rhythm and spacing of properties in the Development Zone. Board members objected to the faux stone used around the porch and suggested Mr. Chilcote simulate a stem wall like 525 Jacobus and stucco the porch wall. Board members also

recommended the detail corners (brackets) on the roof be deleted. Mr. Chilcote agreed will all the suggestions.

**10. Board Discussion of meeting with Development Services Department.**

Noah Sensibar and Jim Bly noted that they had met with Craig Gross and Frank Podgorski about the disconnect between what is approved on the plans and what gets built. City staff noted that procedures aren't completely sorted out from the move of the inspectors from Development Services to Neighborhood Services (DNR). The building inspectors are just inspecting the codes for safety and welfare. The zoning inspectors for historic violations are located in DNR and they do inspections for junk vehicles, trash, and all sorts of things so they are trying to learn the code for Historic Review. City staff said they would work to improve this situation and maybe some inspectors should be dedicated to historic reviews.

**Board Discussion of summer vacation schedules.**

Board members noted the summer meeting schedule might need changing. Dave Knudson is doing his internship and will be gone June through August, Noah Sensibar will be gone June and July, Jim Bly will be gone July, Barbara Macri will be gone June and August, and Matt Williams will be gone August.

**June Meeting:** Three members scheduled to be gone. This leaves six members and five is needed for a quorum.

**July Meeting:** Three members scheduled to be gone. This leaves six members and five is needed for a quorum.

**August Meeting:** Three members scheduled to be gone. Ditto.

**9. Call to the Audience.** No audience.

The next meeting was scheduled for June 3, 2008 at Trinity Presbyterian Church, 400 E. University Blvd. at 6:00 p.m.

**11.** The meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

Minutes recorded and transcribed by Barbara Macri, Secretary.

Blm: wuhzabm5-06-08